Peace, Tolerance and the Palestinian "Other" in Israeli Textbooks

An analysis of state and state-religious Israeli textbooks for grades 1-12

2009-2012

IMPACT-SE Report - June 2012

Yael Teff-Seker

www.impact-se.org
A. Executive Summary

The following is a brief summary of a study conducted by the Institute for Monitoring Peace and Cultural Tolerance in School Education (IMPACT-SE), based on an examination of the Israeli formal education system's attitudes towards the Palestinians, Palestinian nationality and the Israeli-Palestinian peace process. The study focused on the textbooks studied in the Israeli state and state-religious education systems, approved and recommended by the Israeli Ministry of Education for 2009-2012\(^1\).

Sample

The study sample includes 149 textbooks approved by the Israeli Ministry of Education for the Jewish state and state-religious sectors, for grades 1-12 for 2009-2012, as shown in the following chart:

> ![Chart showing textbook distribution by grade](chart.png)

The textbooks chosen for analysis belong to six major academic subjects or disciplines: Hebrew language and literature, history, geography, civics, Jewish and Bible studies and Arabic language (for the Jewish sector), as shown in the following chart:

\[\text{This includes books that were published prior to 2009 but appeared on the list of recommended textbooks for the years 2009-2012.}\]
Method

The study's aim is to examine whether the Israeli education program measures up with international standards in the field of peace education and the establishment of a culture of peace, and in particular: what contents and messages regarding peace with the Palestinian people and tolerance towards the Palestinian "other" does the Israeli educational program teach Israeli children in the Jewish state and state-religious sectors. For this purpose, IMPACT-SE has chosen criteria based on UNESCO resolutions and recommendations regarding peace and tolerance education.

Background

Several researchers in this field have previously described Israeli textbooks as a tool to advance the collective ethnocentric Zionist narrative as well as hostility, stereotypes and prejudice aimed against Palestinians, stating that the Israeli educational curriculum has damaged its students' attitude towards Palestinians and an Israeli-Palestinian peace agreement. However, almost all of these researchers have noted that since the 1990's Israeli textbooks have improved their messages regarding the Arab and Palestinian "other", as well as regarding the Muslim "other", and that there was a change for the better in the description of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, moving towards a more balanced and objective direction, especially in history and civics textbooks.

In the past, IMPACT-SE has performed a large-scale comprehensive study of 565 Israeli textbooks for grades 1-12 in the years 2000-2002. The study findings
showed that in regard to the Palestinians, the state and state-religious Israeli education shows an effort to remove stereotypes, advance the values of peace and tolerance, improve the understanding of the national (Arab/Palestinian) "other" and nurture mutual respect and non-violent conflict resolution between the two sides.

Results

The results of the current (2009-2012) study show that despite the deterioration of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict in the past decade, Israeli textbooks continue to relay messages according to which peace with the Palestinians is both possible and desirable – though also complicated and difficult to achieve. Additionally, textbooks and segments containing material that could damage peace and tolerance education were removed from the curricula, and the Israeli educational program continues to support and improve this type of education.

The major findings are:

1) Israeli textbooks to not contain any call for violence against Palestinians, demonization of Palestinians, glorification of war or justification of violence as a means for Arab-Israeli conflict resolution;
2) Books contain ample representation of the Palestinian point of view, their history, their positions and their rationale, without prejudice;
3) Textbooks describe and acknowledge (conflict-caused) Palestinian suffering;
4) There is a clear attempt to describe the Arab-Israeli conflict in a (less ethnocentric) balanced and objective manner;
5) There is recognition of the Palestinian as a people and of the Palestinian national identity as such;
6) Textbooks feature maps and texts recognizing the Palestinian Authority's borders according to the Oslo Accords;
7) Textbooks recognize the religious (Muslim and Christian) Palestinian affinity to places and areas that are holy to the Palestinian in Israel and the Territories (including Jerusalem);
8) Books recognize the vast Palestinian presence in the Land of Israel prior the first waves of Jewish immigration to Israel and until 1948;
9) Peace agreements, including the Oslo Accords, are portrayed as a positive step towards peaceful conflict resolution;

10) The ideal and final goal in Israeli textbooks, in regard to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, is peace;

11) However: from time to time Palestinians are portrayed in Israeli textbooks as the instigators of Arab-Jewish violence or as a people that does not wish to have peace with Israel, and therefore as those who bear the responsibility for making peace between the two nations impossible.

If divided according to academic subject, findings show:

a) **History Textbooks** portray historic events that relate to the Palestinians in a factual manner and without showing overt preference towards one side or the other, even though they show the Arab and Palestinian side as responsible for the conflict (especially in regard to the 1948 war). Additionally, these books display exact numbers of Palestinian vs. Jewish residents in the Land of Israel prior to the first waves of Jewish immigration and to 1948 in particular (therefore rejecting the notion of Israel as a "land without a people" at the time). Textbooks also describe the establishment and activity of the Palestinian national movement, as well as include the rationale, the formal positions and the feelings of the Palestinian people (especially until and during 1948) without judgment. They portray Palestinian suffering following the flee and eviction of Palestinians, as well as the refugee situation that resulted from the 1948 war. Furthermore, history books describe the development of Islam and the Arab and Muslim historic occupation of Israel in a broad, in depth, respectful and objective manner.

b) **Geography books** include maps that feature the Palestinian territories and define them according to the Oslo Accords (the amount of detail usually depends on the subject of each specific chapter). Additionally, they mention the Israeli-Palestinian peace process quite often and promote the message that a final and comprehensive peace agreement with the Palestinians (as well as Arab countries in general, such as Egypt, Jordan, Syria and Lebanon) is close and possible, as well as optimal for all sides. These books often present the
situation and narratives of the Arab-speaking citizens of Israel, Palestinians, Bedouins and Druze, in an in depth, respectful and non-judgmental manner, and also display the problems and complexity of their situation as Arab citizens in a Jewish state.

c) **Civics textbooks** demonstrate the need to prevent violence and solve conflicts in non-violent ways only, though they also show the Israeli-Palestinian conflict as complex and as one that creates major difficulties for all involved. They factually and objectively depict peace agreements and the diverse political views regarding the peace process in Israeli society, they promote the values of tolerance and equality (for all Israeli citizens), present the Arab-Israeli narrative and letting students form and express their own opinion regarding complex issues that have to do with the conflict, such as social and institutional discrimination against Arab-Israelis.

d) **Hebrew literature and grammar textbooks** include many references to peace with the Arab nations and the Palestinians as very positive and as the (obvious) aspiration of all Israelis. Many poems feature the wish for peace and for an end to war, and fictional stories and other texts show Arab/(Palestinian)-Jewish coexistence as positive.

e) **Jewish and Bible studies textbooks** feature quotes taken from the Bible and from other religious Jewish writings, supporting peace and non-violent conflict resolution, and even suggest that students discuss events such as the Oslo Accords according to them.

f) **Arabic Language textbooks** describe the history, rules and precepts of Islam in a highly accurate respectful manner, quote different Suras from the Koran and include pictures and descriptions of places holy to Islam (among them those located in Israel, the Territories and Jerusalem). These books also present personal Palestinian narratives and other texts that show Arab-Jewish coexistence as positive and practical.

* The *Findings* chapter of the report includes dozens of quotes from dozens of Israeli textbooks regarding the Palestinian "other" that demonstrate the study findings. An entire database of Israeli textbooks quotes found relevant to this study appears on the following site: [www.impact-se.org](http://www.impact-se.org).
B. Method

The current study has examined 149 textbooks included in the Israeli education program for the 2009-2012 academic years (5770-5772 according to the Jewish calendar), including any reference or message appearing in these textbooks and pertaining, directly or indirectly, to Palestinians and the Palestinian Authority. The study included textbooks belonging to the state and state-religious Jewish sectors appearing on the list of textbooks approved and recommended by the Israeli Ministry of Education for grades 1-12.

Sample and composition

The study sample includes 149 textbooks approved by the Israeli Ministry of Education for the Jewish state and state-religious sectors, for grades 1-12 for the years 2009-2012, and includes textbooks from the following academic subjects: history, geography, civics, Hebrew language and literature, Jewish and Bible studies and Arabic language (for Jewish students). The choice of these six categories stems from the higher amount of material in textbooks of these disciplines regarding the Palestinian subject – in comparison to that in other disciplines. One should note that most of the more comprehensive studies conducted in the past on this subject usually only included Israeli history and civics books.

The study examines textbooks included in the curricula for 2009-2012 for all ages: from the 1st grade to the 12th grade. This means that although some books that are included in the study were published before 2009 were also included if they still appeared in the curricula for 2009-2012 academic years. The reason for this is that the study attempted to reflect the curricula as it was actually taught in the classrooms in the abovementioned years.
Division of sample according to age

Division of sample according to subject

Method of Analysis

The study was performed based on six criteria developed by the Institute for Monitoring Peace and Cultural Tolerance in School Education (IMPACT-SE), according to UNESCO recommendations for standards for peace and tolerance education:

1. Do the curriculum and schoolbooks recognize the “other”? Do they promote tolerance [1], understanding and respect toward the “other,” its culture, achievements, values and ways of life? Does it address the sources of intolerance [2]?

2. Do the curriculum and schoolbooks develop capabilities of non-violent conflict resolution [3]?

3. Do the curriculum and schoolbooks promote peace [4] and peace processes? Does it promote international understanding and cooperation? Does it bring the pupil to understand and assume his or her responsibilities for the maintenance of peace [5]?
4. Are the curriculum and schoolbooks free of wording, imagery and ideologies that would likely create prejudices and misconceptions, stereotypes, misunderstandings, mistrust, racial hatred, religious bigotry, and national hatred, as well as any sort of hatred or contempt for other groups or peoples [6]?

5. Are all educational materials (textbooks, workbooks, teachers’ guides, maps, illustrations, aids) up-to-date, accurate, complete, balanced, and unprejudiced, and do they use equal standards so as to promote mutual knowledge and understanding between different peoples [7]?

6. Do the curriculum and schoolbooks include full, adequate and objective data and critical analysis of the historical and contemporary factors underlying the contradictions, disputes, conflicts and tensions between countries and groups, together with study of ways of overcoming these contradictions [8]?

---


[2] Based on ibid, Article 4.2.


[4] The goal of education for peace is the development in an individual of values which are universally recognized, regardless of different socio-cultural contexts. See ibid, Article 6.


[7] Based on ibid, Articles VI.39 and X.45; and the Declaration of Principles on Tolerance Proclaimed and signed by Member States of UNESCO on 16 November 1995, Article 4.3.

Findings: structure and outline

The Findings chapter will be divided into sub-chapters according to academic subject: (a) history, (b) geography, (c) civics, (d) Hebrew language and literature, (e) Judaism and Bible studies, (f) Arabic language. The chapter will address all central messages in these textbooks, and will include quotes, charts and images taken from the textbooks, regarding Palestinians and the PA. The contents found in each subject will be divided according to the abovementioned IMPACT-SE developed criteria, though for the purposes of this report they have been concentrated into four, observing whether the text contains:

(1) **A balanced description** of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and encouraging the student to develop independent thought;
(2) **Acknowledgment** of the Palestinian "other";
(3) **Awareness** of positions, points of view and suffering of the Palestinian "other";
(4) Support for **peaceful conflict resolution**.

The Findings chapter of the report includes dozens of quotes from Israeli textbooks regarding the Palestinian "other" that demonstrate the study findings. An entire database of Israeli textbooks quotes found relevant to this study appears on the following site: [www.impact-se.org](http://www.impact-se.org).

Study conclusions

Study conclusions are introduced in the Discussion and Conclusions chapter and will include a summary of all finding relating to the Palestinian "other" according to the four criteria as well as according to each academic subject (as presented in the Findings chapter).
C. Findings

Although in general, one can see similar types of messages encouraging peace and tolerance towards the Palestinian "other", the manners in which these are expressed and delivered to the students is sometimes different. In this chapter, we will show how every academic subject or discipline relays messages pertaining to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, as well as to peace and to tolerance towards the Palestinian "other", and to what degree they match the criteria described earlier (in the Method chapter).

1. History Books

a) A balanced description of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and encouraging the student to develop independent thought

History textbooks demonstrate a clear attempt to portray the Jewish-Palestinian conflict in a balanced, accurate and comprehensive manner, without prejudice. Although books show the Palestinians (alongside other Arab nations) the initiator of the 1948 war, as well as (most) pre-1948 Arab-Jewish violence, this can many times be attributed to historical facts. Additionally, most books also show the rationale behind Palestinian objection to the establishment of the Jewish settlement and late the Jewish state in the territory of the Land of Israel. Furthermore, the approach given in textbooks is not that of "us" and "them", but rather an objective and professional reference, showing the turn of events factually and chronologically, with the fact presented without any judgment. Alternatively, the students are asked questions that invite them to deal with complex issues that are relevant to today's politics, and independently form their opinion based on the facts before them.
**Quotes:**

_The Events of October 2000_

On September 29th, 2000, the Arab citizens of Israel began large-scale violent demonstrations, in protest of Ariel Sharon, then the head of the opposition, visiting the Temple Mount in Jerusalem. The demonstrations, which included roadblocks and stone throwing, continued for three days and required substantial police involvement. During the oppression of the riots, the police used firearms and caused the death of 12 Arab citizens. Following these events, an official committee was formed – the Or committee [...]. The committee linked the violent outburst to the socio-economic state of the Arabs of Israel, concluding that: "the events, their unusual nature and their severe results are the result of deep seeded elements, which have created a volatile situation among the Arab public in Israel. These elements, including the state and its governments, have erred by failing to deeply and comprehensively cope with the difficult problems posed by the existence of a large Arab minority in the Jewish state. The governmental treatment of the Arab sector has been mostly characterized by neglect and mistreatment [...]. The state did not do enough, and did not try enough, to give its Arab citizens equality and to eradicate the phenomena of discrimination and mistreatment.

(In: Nationality: Building a State in the Middle East

**Questions:**

1. Why will Jewish terrorism against Arabs [in the 1940’s] hurt Jews, in Ben-Gurion's opinion?
2. What two advantages rise from the way of breaking the policy of restraint [in face of Arab terrorism] according to Raziel?
3. [...]

(2009, p. 188).
4. What way seems better to you – controlled restraint or "an eye for an eye"? Explain your answer.

(In: Nationality in Israel and the People: Building a State in the Middle East, 2009, p. 43).

Write about the Six-Day war from three points of view:

a. An Israeli soldier writing a letter home.

b. An Egyptian soldier writing to his family from his captivity in Israel.

c. A [female] resident of a refugee camp in Gaza that was occupied by Israel.


The relationship between Israel and the Palestinian population has a long history of violent conflict. The Palestinians are demanding to establish a sovereign state within the boundaries of Israel, in the territories of Judea and Samaria and the Gaza strip. Among the Israeli governments along the years there have been difference opinions regarding this demand, some support it and some are strongly against it.

As part of the Oslo Accords in 1993 – the government of Israel, headed by Yitzhak Rabin, had decided to proceed in the road that would lead to the establishment of a Palestinian state. Since then the two sides – the Palestinian Authority and the state of Israel – have conducted ongoing negotiations, but until the winter of 2008 these negotiations have not produced an agreement that could enable the setting of a border accepted by both parties.

Fighting in the Mixed Cities [in 1948]

In all the mixed cities (Jaffa, Jerusalem, Haifa, Tiberius and Zefat) the Arabs began to execute terrorist acts against Jews and their property. Terrorist acts included snipers shooting at Jewish neighborhoods, deploying bombs and grenades as well as using explosives. Jerusalem and Haifa were the two cities in which most of the terrorist acts occurred on both sides. An example for the Arab terrorist acts: blowing up a mail truck in central Haifa, slaughtering dozens of Jewish workers in the Haifa oil distilleries, blowing up the Palestine Post building in Jerusalem. In an explosion of two car bombs in Jerusalem's Ben Yehuda Street, 50 people were killed in their sleep. On March 11th the Arabs performed a bold terrorist attack when they succeeded in inserting a car bomb into the park yard of the Israeli government and caused massive damage and loss of lives.

The three [Jewish] resistance movements reacted with counter-terrorism: hurling bombs into the Arabs markets of Jerusalem (in the Jaffa and Shechem gates) by the Etzel ["Irgun"], exploding houses as part of Hagana raids on the lower city in Haifa, blowing up the old "Sar"a building in the clock square in Jaffa by Lehi people and exploding the "Semiramis" hotel in the Katamon neighborhood [in Jerusalem] by the Hagana people.


b) Acknowledgment of the Palestinian "other"

History textbooks acknowledge the Palestinian "other" and the most recent books also emphasize the national Palestinian movement as one that existed long before 1948, though Zionism is often mentioned as a catalyst to the development of Palestinian national aspirations and political crystallization. Textbooks show that there was a large Arab majority in the Land of Israel before the major immigration waves
(beginning in the late 19th century) and acknowledge the historic territorial Arab presence in Israel.

*The use of the terms "the Arabs of Israel" or "Arabs of the land" to describe the Palestinian Arabs that resided in the area of the Land of Israel until 1948 is very common in Israeli history books. The term "Palestinians" appears in some books, and is more commonly found in newer books. However, this does not mean that the legitimacy of the Palestinian identity or the Palestinian political movement is denied, and often the two types of names (Arab/Palestinian) are mentioned in the same textbook.

**Quotes:**

"Following the British occupation the Arabs of Israel were disconnected from their historic hub in Syria, and the crystallization of a separate Palestinian identity began."


---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Situation of the Jewish Settlement in 1917</th>
<th>The Situation of the Jewish Settlement in 1945</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population of about 60,000</td>
<td>Population of about 550,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jews vs. 600,000 Arabs</td>
<td>Jews vs. 1,200,200 Arabs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(In: Nationality: Building a State in the Middle East, 2009, p. 11).
In this reality a new approach grew stronger in the beginning of the 1920s among the Arabs of Israel. The detached themselves from Greater Syria and began to establish a unique national identity, in the core of which was the demand "Palestine to the Palestinians". Additionally, they demanded that Britain realize the Palestinian national rights and opposed any discussion with the Zionist regarding the Land of Israel.


In the 1930s Arab national movements were formed all over the Middle East. Many of the Arabs of Israel also began to establish a national consciousness – meaning, the perception that they are not only part of the great Arab nation but also Palestinians, the residents of Palestine [Falastin]. [...] The Palestinian Arabs were not yet organized in political movements and institutions as the Zionist movement was. The majority, which were uneducated farmers, were influenced by religious and traditional preachers, who saw the Zionist settlement in the Land of Israel as sacrilege [...] The leaders of the Yishuv [Jewish settlement] already understood that they are not settling in an empty land [...].


If you lived in the Land of Israel at the time [the 1930s] as a Jew, what would you think of the chances of the Jewish settlement to continue to grow? If you were a Palestinian Arab, what would you think of the chances of the Palestinian national movement to succeed?

c) Awareness of positions, points of view and suffering of the Palestinian "other"

History textbooks often present not only the Jewish/Israeli positions but also the Palestinian positions throughout the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, especially until and including the 1948 war, and later in the 1980's onwards (describing the first and second Intifada and the Oslo Accords). In some textbooks one can even find direct quotes from Palestinian leaders and civilians, expressing their personal opinion regarding the conflict.

The Palestinian suffering following the Arab-Israeli conflict, especially that resulting from the 1948 war, is often represented in the description of the consequences of war. The term "Nakba" (in Arabic: "the catastrophe"), used to describe the Palestinian point of view regarding this suffering is also present in several history textbooks.

Quotes:

During the fighting many of the Arabs of Israel were expelled. Some fled before the Jews came to the Arab village or neighborhood, and some were forcefully banished by the conquering force.


Because of the military defeat and the refugee problem the Arabs call the war of 1948, which the Jews call "The War of Independence" – "Al Nakba", in Arabic, the Catastrophe.

Those who objected to the Palestinian elite, the Communist Arabs, also described the harsh state of the Palestinians in Jerusalem:

"Arab neighborhoods were left by their residents... Fleeing continues from all the neighborhoods near the Jewish quarters. The economic situation is so severe that a dark piece of bread is considered the most precious thing in our world... With every gunshot the city's economic life is stopped, the shops are locked... All transportation is halted and the city of Jerusalem is detached from the rest of the country..."

The Arabs objected to the right of the Jews over the Land of Israel. They adopted the view that the Jews are not a nation and that Judaism is only a religion, and that therefore the Jews have no right to sovereignty over territory. However – the Arabs are a nation, and therefore, they claim, the Land of Israel belongs to them.

(In: Time Travel: Building a State in the Middle East, 2009, p. 42).

On the first day of the Sinai War, a shocking event took place in the village of Kfar Qasem. In the village, residing in the center of Israel, [...] 49 women, men and children were murdered by the border patrol company that was deployed in the area. Due to the outbreak of war the curfew hour for the Jordan bordering villages was pushed forward to the late afternoon, without informing the residents that were working outside the village. The villagers were used to a night-time curfew, and therefore returned from their work after it had begun. In Kfar Qasem a border patrol officer followed the instructions given at the time the order was sent out: shoot whoever breaks the curfew. His soldiers shot to death those who returned through the checkpoint from their fields and other work. It should be noted that in other villages, where the residents also returned after curfew, the commanders were more forgiving and understanding towards those who were late, and did not follow the command to shoot.

[...] The Kfar Qasem massacre is a warning sign for the rule of law in the Israel and following the legal term "A clearly illegal order" ["Pкуда Билит Гуки Балпі" ] (clearly=obviously) was created. This is an order that no one should follow no matter who gave it, because it contradicts basic human values without a substantial reason.

(In: Knowing History – Nationality in Israel and the People/I Building a State in the Middle East, 2009, p. 213).
d) Support for peaceful conflict resolution

While less recent history textbooks have a tendency not to elaborate regarding the events that occurred after 1948, more recent ones also include a description of the conflict and the peace processes that took place during and after the 1950’s. The portrayal of peace accords and negotiations is usually factual and objective, and the support and objection to them from all sides (Palestinian and Israeli, left and right wing), is shown without prejudice. However, in some of the textbooks peace agreements are displayed as an important and even monumental step forward, and as actions that were performed out of good reasons, even if their results, thus far, are not the ones for which the Israeli side had hoped.

Quotes:

The Oslo Accords held great significance to both sides. Through them the first compromise between Israel and the Palestinians was achieved, a compromise that wished to create an opening to a broader reconciliation process, and improve relations between Israel and other Arab states. The Oslo accords gave the Palestinians the opportunity to establish a state for the first time.

[...] However the accords also raised a lot of opposition among the Israeli public. The agreement was confirmed with a very small majority in the Knesset [...] Most of the left supported the agreement and hopes it would bring about an end to violence, while in the right there was severe criticism of Yitzhak Rabin [...] Additionally, Yitzhak Rabin was blamed for neglecting the security of the citizens of Israel, and even relinquishing vast territories from the homeland of the Jewish people.

[...] The Oslo Accords also caused disagreement among the Arabs. Arafat's opponents blamed him for acknowledging the existence of the state of Israel. He was accused of betraying the Palestinian people by signing an agreement whose implementation is vague, and which does not solve the most burning issues of the Palestinian people.
The signing ceremony of the Oslo Accords ("The Declaration of Principles") on the White House lawns, September 1993.

Participants include Prime Minister Yitzhak Rabin, PLO leader Yasser Arafat and president of the United States Bill Clinton. Clinton prevented Arafat to kiss him and Rabin, a habit to which he was accustomed.

**Question:**

Compare this photograph with that of the three leaders in the peace treaty with Egypt in Camp David (p. 198). Are there differences between them? Explain.

[The photograph on page 198 shows a warm three-way handshake between Begin, Carter and Sadat, with all three smiling wholeheartedly].

(In: Nationality: Building a State in the Middle East, 2009, p. 208)
In the 1990’s there is a dialogue towards peace with the Palestinian Arabs living in the Judea, Samaria and Gaza areas. This peace process is focused on the negotiations over the territories of Judea and Samaria, since the Gaza Strip and Jericho were already handed over to the Palestinians in 1994.

These negotiations are progressing with great difficulty. We hope that they will succeed, we hope that we will finally achieve peace with all of the Arab states. And peace will come to Israel.


From Yitzhak Rabin’s speech in the Oslo Accords signing ceremony, 13.9.1993

[...] We, the soldiers who have returned from battles stained with blood... we who have seen our relatives and friends killed before our eyes... we who have fought against you, the Palestinians — we say to you today, in a loud and a clear voice: enough of blood and tears. Enough!

We have no desire for revenge. We harbor no hatred towards you. We, like you, are people who want to build a home, to plant a tree, to love, to live side by side with you in dignity, in empathy, as human beings, as free men. We are today giving peace a chance, and saying again to you: "Enough".

(In: Knowing History – Nationality in Israel and the People: Building a State in the Middle East, 2009, p. 272).
2. Geography Books

a) A balanced description of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and encouraging the student to develop independent thought

Geography textbooks attempt to present the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and the peace process in an objective, balanced and inclusive manner, and ask students difficult questions that are at the heart of the debate regarding the conflict, in order to encourage them to form and express their own opinion independently. Additionally, geography books, much like civics books, elaborate on the subject of Arab (Palestinian) Israeli citizens – their status and situation, their national and political identity, and the treatment they receive by the Israeli government and society – all in a respectful, elaborate and critical manner (critical of Israeli government and society).

Quotes:

The border between Israel and the Palestinians is one that raises difficult problems. The conflict regards the territories that the Jews call "The Land of Israel" and see it as part of their homeland, while the Arabs call it "Falastin" [Palestine] and see it as part of their homeland. Between Israel and the Palestinians living in Judea and Samaria there is no border yet; however in the Gaza strip – Israel has taken its people out of the strip unilaterally in 2005, and today there is a temporary border there.


The Oslo Agreement (1993) and the establishment of the Palestinian Authority
caused the erection of a fence that separated between the Israeli settlements and the Gaza Strip in which a million Arabs live. The fence makes infiltration harder but does not prevent terrorist attacks in the Jewish settlements. The situation of the Gush Katif settlements is particularly difficult due to their proximity to the Arab cities. In the year 2004 Prime Minister Ariel Sharon offered a unilateral withdrawal plan to evict Gush Katif.


---

The Cave of Patriarchs – a Place of Worship for Jews and Muslims

After the Six-Day war procedures were made that would enable prayer for Muslims and Jews in the Cave of Patriarchs. The large hall, Yitzhak hall, remained a mosque, and in the two other rooms temporary synagogues were erected. [...] Both sides were not happy with the new arrangements. The Muslims protested against the mere entry of Jews to pray in the building, and the Jews, who received limited rights, began a public struggle to achieve equal status to that of the Muslims. Inter-religious tension reached its peak in Purim 5754 (1994). Dr. Baruch Goldstein, a Jewish doctor from Kiryat Arba, went into the Cave of Patriarchs and shot at worshippers in the Mosque. 29 Muslims were killed and tens were wounded. Goldstein himself was killed by the Muslim worshippers. A government committee of inquiry of the event recommended new procedures in order to create complete separation between the Jewish and the Muslim worshippers, in order to prevent any friction between them.

b) Acknowledgment of the Palestinian "other"

Geography textbooks recognize the Palestinian "other" geographically, when featuring maps and texts including the green line and/or Palestinian settlements such as Nablus, Gaza, Ramallah etc.), and in some cases presenting the Palestinian Authority's borders according to the Oslo Accords (fully or partially). Geography textbooks also recognize political-national Palestinian identity, emphasizing Arab Israeli citizen's attitudes towards their Palestinian identity. Additionally, geography textbooks recognize Muslim and Christian religious affinity to places or areas is Israel and the Territories.

Quotes:

*In the Palestinian Authority area there are four local water factories for home water supply, in Hebron, in Bethlehem, in Ramallah and in Jenin. […]*

(In: Israel, the Main Mountain: Judea, Samaria and the Jordan Valley, 2002, p. 73).

As the Jewish settlement in Israel strengthened and in light of separation trends of the Arab world, the Arabs of Israel began to establish their identities as Palestinians.

[Title:] Jerusalem Area

[Legend:] [...] The Israeli Palestinian Interim Agreement March 2000

[Light brown:] A territory; [yellow] B territory [...] 

[Caption Below:] Exhibit 18: Planning a map of Jerusalem towards the agreements
The Land of Israel in general and Jerusalem in particular became more and more sacred in Islamic thought — as it spread and evolved, both religiously and geographically. The more Islam received from the world it conquered, the more it
processed and Islamized the values it received including the sanctity of the Land of Israel, its vegetation and its water, its life, the sanctity of being buried in it etc.. All of these became at that time a part of orthodox Islam [...]. The expression for the sanctity of the Land of Israel and of Jerusalem for Islam is given by the establishment of the two mosques on the Temple Mount.

(In: This is the Land – an Introduction to Israel Studies, 1999, p. 161).


c) Awareness of positions, points of view and suffering of the Palestinian "other"

Geography textbooks describe the lives of the Palestinians and their suffering following their status as refugees (alongside the Israeli suffering in the fighting that surrounded the establishment of the state of Israel). Additionally, some books encourage the students to learn more about their (Israeli) Palestinian neighbors on their own.

Quotes:

The Refugees and the Refugee Camps

During the War of Independence and at its end many of the Arab residents had to leave their homes and villages, and found themselves at the end of the war outside the borders of Israel. These residents, who were defined as refugees of war, settled in the
neighboring Arab states [...]. Some of the refugees integrated into the local population and settled in the villages or in the cities, though man lived in refugee camps erected in Judea, Samaria, the Jordan Valley, and the east bank of the Jordan River. Living conditions in the camps were difficult and the population living there suffered poverty and neglect, despite the aid given to the refugees by international organizations. The distressed population of the refugee camps was the main source for "infiltrators" to the state of Israel, and later on – the core of the terrorist organizations that acted against Israel. [...] A large part of the refugees kept their refugee status and refused to settle down and rehabilitate, hoping that they would be able to return to their homes that are in Israeli territory.


Choose one of the following fronts: Lebanese, Jordanian-Iraqi or Egyptian. Use the literature on the War of Independence.

a. Describe in detail the events of the events surrounding the Israeli coastal plain in that front.

b. Describe the struggle of the [Jewish] settlements.

c. The fate of the Arab settlements [in Israel] and their residents.

[In: The Coastal Plain: Man and Environment through the Ages, 1997, p. 360).

The new state that drew blood at its inception and lost about six thousand of its sons, was not recognized by the Arab world. The problem of the Arab refugees that relocated beyond the border line was also among the problems that made it difficult to restore peace to the area.
2. Try to visit one of the Arab settlements in Israel:

   a. Report your impressions: the village houses (the building material and style), public institutions [...], the village's size, the quality of the roads, vehicles, stores, style of clothing. Address the quality of life in the village in comparison to the city of Tel Aviv.

   b. Is the village you visited a traditional village or a modern settlement? Explain.


   Most of the Arab refugees left Israel during the War or Independence (in 1947-1949) and during the Six-Day War (1967). The hundreds of thousands of Palestinian refugees scattered in different countries in the world, especially in the Middle East. They are known as "Palestinian refugees", and their exact number is in dispute.

   Some of the Arab refugees settled down and assimilated in the places where they arrived, some returned to their homes with the permission of the state of Israel, and many live to this day in refugee camps and slums – whether because the Arab states refuse to absorb them as equal rights citizens, or whether because they themselves avoided assimilating into those states. In the refugee camps the population grows at a fast pace, and living conditions there are very difficult – unemployment rates are high, quarters are tight and meager, and the level of medicine, education and sanitation services is low.

d) Support for peaceful conflict resolution

Geography textbooks portray relations with the Palestinians as an ongoing peace process, which will soon end when a peace agreement is signed. Geography books do show the complexity of the situation where Israel is striving for peace under the threat of terrorism, but peace is still seen as the best and the most practical solution for the Arab-Israeli conflict and the Israeli-Palestinian conflict in particular. The former includes signing peace agreements with Syria and Lebanon and strengthening ties with Egypt and Jordan.

**Quotes:**

*In the interim arrangements for Judea and Samaria, signed in Oslo in 1995, it was agreed that a joint Israeli-Palestinian commission would handle all the elements that have to do with the use of the mountain aquifer, in the present and in the future [...]. When the permanent arrangements will be discussed between Israel and the Palestinians, there will be a need to discuss and agree upon the manner in which the Jordan River's water will be used by the Palestinians, water supply routes for the Jewish settlements of Judea and Samaria, and the water allocation to each side. At any rate, it is clear that the aquifer water that is in the mountains of Judea and Samaria will always be shared by Israel and the Palestinians. This is unless the Palestinians pollute this precious treasure and hurt themselves the most in the process. In 2006 Israel was prepared for this possibility.*


*As for the permanent borders between Israel and the Palestinians there are three main approaches:*
1) Returning to the borders of 1967: Israel will return to the "Green Line" [...] and in these territories a Palestinian state will be established. This is the scenario demanded by the Palestinians, by the Arab states and by different groups in Israel.

2) Compromise and border adjustments [...].

3) Greater Israel [Eretz Israel Hashlema]: [...].

The area's unrest and the lack of mutually approved borders influence life in Israel, the level of security, the economic situation and tensions between different groups in Israeli society, as well as between Israel and its neighbors.

[...] 2. Describe in detail the advantages, difficulties and problems of each of the 3 approaches regarding the setting of permanent borders between Israel and the Palestinian Authority. State your position and explain it.

3. What are the repercussions of a lack of peace, and therefore a lack of organized borders, on our region? Refer to the following subjects: security, keeping the law, settlements, social moral, economy, education and welfare, emigration and immigration, planning and development, foreign investments, Israel's international status.


The problem of the Arab refugees is a complicated political problem and a painful human problem, and it is one of the most difficult and complex issues in the long Arab-Israeli conflict. As part of the talks on peace agreements between Israel and its neighbors this subject is also put on the discussion table, and there is no doubt that its solution will be vital to achieving peace in the Middle East.

3. Civics Books

a) A balanced description of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and encouraging the student to develop independent thought

Civics textbooks supply a large amount of information of the Jewish and democratic nature of the state of Israel and emphasize the complexity of Israeli society, including its attitude towards the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and its solution (political gaps) and the status of the Palestinian population in Israel. Much like history and geography books, there is an attempt to show the historical events relevant to the Palestinians in a balanced and objective manner.

Quotes:

The Kaadan Case

In 1996 the Kaadan family – an Arab family from Baqa el Garbia – turned to the acceptance committee of the Katzir settlement, requesting to be accepted as residents in the settlement and built its home there. The family's request was denied, and the reason given was that the settlement was intended for Jews only. The family appealed to the High Court of Justice through the "Civil Rights Association". Its claim was Katzir was situated on state land and therefore there is no basis for discrimination between Jewish and Arab. In a precedential decision the court decided that the state of Israel must see the equality between all sectors of the population as holy, and therefore, in allowing only Jews to live on state land the law is violated. In 2007 another decision was given, ordering Katzir to allow the Kaadan family, as well as other families, to build its home in Katzir.

The Arab minority claims that the right to return to their country should be given to the refugee Arabs and their families, who fled the country in the War of Independence (1948). They call this the Right of Return. Israel opposes their return, stating that the small Jewish state must remain as the state of the Jewish nation, giving respect and rights to the Arab minority living in its midst.


On the one hand, the Arabs, the Druze and the Circassians in Israel realize their civic rights: they are entitled to elect and be elected to government institutions, both on state level to the Knesset and on local level to local authorities, and they have the freedom of assembly to establish political parties that will represent them in the Knesset. However, in many areas the Arabs' right to equality is not realized and there is an inequality between Jews and minorities. This inequality is expressed by discrimination in budget allocation for education and for local authorities and by discrimination in employment and hiring, especially in the civil service.

Additionally, the Arab parties are not represented in the government, outside the Knesset, and they were never invited to join the coalition, despite the fact that there are Arab parties in the Knesset.


b) Acknowledgment of the Palestinian "other"

Civics textbooks recognize the national Palestinian identity of both those living in the Palestinian Authority and of those living in Israel. They also recognize the Palestinian authority as an autonomous political-national entity, and display the (temporary)
borders agreed upon in the Oslo Accords.

**Quotes:**

The Palestinian identity [of the Arabs of Israel] is expressed by solidarity with the Palestinian people, supporting the PLO and a two-state solution. They demand to include Palestinian fundamentals in their education system. [...] However they are still conflicted regarding their Palestinian identity. Most of the Arabs of Israel are not interested in leaving Israel for any Arab state. No Arab state will supply welfare services and civil freedom. Nonetheless, the status of Israeli Arabs as Palestinians (the process of Palestinization)is growing stronger.


It is true, the Arab citizens of Israel are nationally identified with the Arab nation and the Palestinian nation; nevertheless, as citizens in the state of Israel they are bound to the state and to its rules. The Arab citizens of Israel hold Israel responsible for the creation of the Palestinian problem and therefore see it as a state that hurts their fellow Palestinians. Among certain groups in Jewish society there is a sense of mistrust towards them because they identify with the Palestinian struggle for the establishment of a Palestinian state alongside the state of Israel. One of the expressions of this feeling is the call of some of the Jewish public to take away the right of the Arab citizens of Israel to be partake in some of the public and political decision making, such as regarding the future of the territories of Judea and Samaria, as well as a call to include Arabs as ministers or as other high ranking officials in the Israeli government. One should mention that this objection contradicts the democratic nature of the state of Israel.

Title: The Declaration of Independence: Historical and Geopolitical Background

The Borders of State of Israel

[Legend: Purple: Israel; Orange: Areas A + B ; White: Area C]

Caption at the bottom of the map: Area A: Complete Control by PA; Area B: Civil control by PA; Area C: Complete control by Israel

(In: To Be Citizens in Israel, a Jewish and Democratic State, p. 13.)
c) Awareness of positions, points of view and suffering of the Palestinian "other"

Civics textbooks describe the hardships of the Palestinian-Arab sector in the state of Israel, its coping with the issue of its Palestinian identity and with the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. The point of view of the Arab citizens of Israel is described both directly and indirectly (quoting Arab-Israeli citizens and leaders and/or describing different positions and narratives of Arab Israelis). Most books address the issue of Palestinian identity of the Arab-Israelis but still choose to call them "the Arabs of Israel", though this does not seem to have any political implications (at most, books try to show Arab-Israelis as another kind of citizens and attempt to show that their civic status should be equal to that of other, namely Jewish, citizens). Additionally, some of the hardships of non-Israeli Palestinians are also presented, such as their need to cope with their refugee status after 1948.

Quotes:

Arabs in Israel – what does the Arab youth in Israel say?:

"We are actually one family", declares Muhsein Elsah, a youth guide, "and we are between a rock and a hard place. On the one hand we are loyal to the state and on the other we cannot sit idly by, when we see and hear what is happening with our brothers beyond the Green Line a few kilometers from us."

"99% of the Arab sector is loyal to the state of Israel," claims Muhsein Elsah, "and our identification with our people costs us a lot. Our sympathy for our brothers in Nablus, in Ramallah or in Jenin is exactly the same as the Jews' sympathy for their brethren in Moscow. My loyalty to the state has not changed, but why can't I sympathize with members of my people that are in distress?"

"The Arabs in Israel see their relatives in the territories suffering," Says Suhad Garirah, "and they cannot sit quietly. They have to prove their loyalty to their people too".
The War of Independence 1948 – many Arabs run away and some are banished from the territory of the new state of Israel, and thus the problem of the Palestinian refugees is created. The ones who stayed are the Arab minority of the state of Israel and their decedents.

Caption reads: Arab citizens demonstrating outside the Supreme Court during the convening of the Or Committee, September 3rd, 2000. [The Or Committee was established to inquire the
clashes between Israeli law enforcement forces and Palestinian Israeli citizens in October 2000, and was finally formed on November 8th, 2000. The caption is therefore incorrect].


[...] I do not demand that [Israel] stops being "Zionist" or "Jewish", but it is my right as a citizen, as a man created in God's image, to be sure that my children, who were born in the land of their fathers and their fathers' fathers will receive natural rights, bestowed according to the rules of natural justice to all mortals. [...] 

It cannot be that in a developed and dynamic state such as Israel there will be settlements without basic services – running water, electric lights, infirmaries and sewage facilities – and all these settlements are populated by one type of people – Arabs.  

The existence of this phenomenon does not only testify to the lack of equality, but also causes feelings of frustration and disdain on the part of those who are mistreated and "dulls the senses" of those who are not mistreated and encourages them to protect their powerful "special" interests. Justifying the discrimination perpetuates the emotional chasm dividing the people who dwell in this country. The lack of equality inside the "Green Line" gives it justification".


d) Support for peaceful conflict resolution

Civics books present an objective account of the different approaches in Israeli society regarding peace agreements that include territorial concessions for peace (from the right, center and left). They describe peace negotiations factually and without prejudice, although the final goal stemming from the messages they include is peace with the Palestinians (and never a violent solution for the conflict).

Quotes:

The issue of foreign affairs and security – [...] According to this issue, one can present the parties across an axis on the right of which there is an objection to a Palestinian state, an objection to disengagement from the territories of Judea and Samaria as well as the Golan Heights, and promote a stern policy against those who resist. On the left end of the axis we will locate parties that support disengagement from the territories of Judea and Samaria as well as the Golan Heights, support the establishment of a Palestinian state and for exhausting all possibilities for compromise in order to achieve peace.


"[...] And indeed, we did not only make war, but also peace. We have already made peace with Egypt and Jordan and set a framework for negotiations with the Palestinians, but the threat has not yet been lifted. The reason is, we did not finish the process. It is not enough to have peace with Egypt and Jordan. As part of negotiations with the Palestinians we must add more and accept the fact that they are a separate national entity. It is not enough to have partial, fragmented peace. In order to lift the threat off of Israel's future, there is a need for full peace. [...]"

Arie Naor, "Zionism of Peace", Maariv, 6.2.1993
In 1994 a political process began between Israel and the Palestinians. As part of the agreements signed by the two parties (The Oslo Accords), the Palestinian Authority received the administrative responsibility for part of the territories of Judea and Samaria and the Gaza strip. The perception of the Oslo Accords was that these were steps of a process that would one day bring peace between the people, although this wish has not yet been fulfilled.
4. Hebrew Language and Literature

a) A balanced description of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and encouraging the student to develop independent thought

As in History textbooks, Israeli Hebrew language literature textbooks depict the Israeli-Palestinian conflict as one that should end peacefully but also as one where the Palestinian side has badly hurt the Jewish side, which could make the road to peace more difficult. However, unlike history textbooks, literature and language textbooks describe both extremes with heightened pathos: on the one hand they feature a deep and strong yearning for peace, especially in poems; but on the other hand they express the pain and difficulty resulting from Palestinian attacks and glorify the bravery, the loyalty and the fighting spirit of those who fought – especially in fictional stories and in reading compositions.

Some textbooks describe the nature of (Palestinian) Arab-Israeli society respectfully and without prejudice. Literature anthologies and grammar books often mention Yitzhak Rabin, his legacy, his speeches and the peace process he led, as well as David Ben Gurion (especially in regard to the 1948 war and the declaration of independence).

Quotes:

On the mountain top was Zefat. The days were those of the War of Independence. The Arabs barge into the city from all sides. And the guys bravely push them back. One against a hundred. And the town's people – some are filling sand bags and others are building firing positions; some are digging trenches and others are tending to the wounded. Fierce fire comes down on the city, the roar of war is loud. No house is unharmed. And the weapons the lads have is meager and insufficient. […]
At the same time one boy rose [...] In the large fire, in the rain of bullet shots –

He climbed a pole on the roof and hung the Israeli flag on it. The people of Zefat saw the flag and their spirit were revived. Then they fought like lions and did not let the enemy penetrate the town.

They bravely held on in this manner until the Palmach boys came and saved the city and banished the enemy from Zefat and its surroundings.


Yitzhak Rabin / Hanna Bar

[...] One time, when he returned from school, he and his friends were caught in an Arab riot, Jews were hurt, blood was spilt, and noise and shouting filled the street. The British, who then rules the country, did nothing to stop the riots. [...] In 1945, when Yitzhak was 23, the war ended. Thousands of refugees wanted to come to Israel. The English didn't let everyone enter, and the Palmach went to their aid, and in different ways helped them enter the country. The Arabs continued their attacks, burning stored and shooting at vehicles on the move.

[...] And in 1992 he was elected Prime Minister again, and became a fighter again. However this time he was a fighter for peace. "Enough of blood and tears...Enough to victims on both sides," he said on the White House lawns in the United States, and shook the hand of Arafat, the chairman of the PLO. They both committed to search for ways to solve the conflict through bilateral negotiations.

(In: In the Language of Lines 5, 2003, 149-151).

"An interesting phenomenon is the leading names among the Muslims and Druze. The Muslims, much like the ultra orthodox Jews, cling to more traditional names, and consciously waver any imagination in name giving. The six leading names among
boys are: Muhammad, Ahmad, Mahmud, Yusuf, Ali, Omar. Among the girls there is a more interesting diversity: Aya(h), Asil, Adn, Fatimah, Nur, Maryam.


b) Acknowledgment of the Palestinian "other"

Literature textbooks hardly ever discuss the subject of non-Israeli Palestinians specifically, though they do address the Arab-Israeli conflict in general (usually through the Jewish-Israeli point of view), as well as to the Palestinian population of Israel. However, the stories and reading excerpts do not include delving into the issue of Palestinian identity of Arab Israeli citizens. Nevertheless, there is quite frequent mentioning of Muslim and Christian affinity to Jerusalem and to other holy places in Israel and the Territories.

Quotes:

Jerusalem / Rivka Levi

Jerusalem is a city that is holy to Jews, Christians and Muslims.

It has many synagogues, churches and mosques.

(In: Marching in the Road of Words 1, 2008, p. 184).
Jerusalem / Rachel Farhi

A bell rings the smell of frankincense, the Muezzin calls from the top

Of a mosque, and a small hyssop that grew on a foundation stone on a

Keystone and the sound of a prayer the sound of silence.

Three prayers and such an old city.


Numbers / Sha’anan Street

1 is the number between Jordan and the sea

2 is the number of states that will one day be here […]


c) Awareness of positions, points of view and suffering of the Palestinian "other"

Grammar and literature textbooks show the Palestinian other, the citizen of Israel, as an individual and as one who has qualities that make him or her more human to the readers (familial, friendly etc.). Palestinian suffering is not featured in these books, but probably because they tend not to tend to the subject of non-Israeli Palestinians.

Quotes:
Interview with Amir Jiryis Jubran

The area where I live, the Lod Ramla area, is an area full of rich history. [...] When the Muslim occupied Israel, it was even the capital.

The Jubran's familial roots are in Nazareth. My grandparents lived in Nazareth and then moved to Lod, but my father was already born in Lod. [...].

In our neighborhood there is a mixed population of Jews and Arabs [...].

At lunch we all eat together, except for Samir, Marlin and father. Father is at work and he comes back at seven in the evening [...] The drink we like the most is coke, but in the winter we have more tea and instant coffee or hot chocolate.


In the life of the Arab family it is customary that the extended family all lives in one place. The houses are large and spacious and have several floors. In Israel there are many young couples that live separately from their parents in houses and apartments that are not close to the house of the parents. The Arab family lives in one village and sees each other every day.


Other Days Came / Yossi Margalit / Told by Hanna Brenner

[...] The building where we lived belonged to Mohammed from the village of Lifta, to the west of Jerusalem. Every month Mohammed would arrive at our house to receive the rent. My father would invite me to sit in the porch and my mother used to serve
him a cup of tea and a slice of raisin cake, which she baked. Between one sip and another Mohammed asked my father about his life in Poland, and my father would ask Mohammed how things were in the village and about his close and distant family members. [...] This is how the families were until I was eight, just before the 29th of November 1947, the day the UN decided about the division of the Land of Israel to two states: a Jewish state and an Arab state.

A wave of violent acts swept the country and Mohammed stopped coming to our house. We also refrained from going to Lifta, worried that we might get hurt on the way.

A few months passed, one day my father came home sad and upset "I saw a convoy of donkey carts near the neighborhood of 'Meah Shearin'“, my father said, "and on the furniture, pillows, mattresses, bundled clothes and housewears. On one of the carts sat Mohammed. 'Where to?' I asked him. 'To Jordan', he answered. 'Why?' – 'Scared of what the Jews will do to us'. 'And where is your family?' 'Fatima and my children left a month ago'. 'Go back home, Mohammed', I told him, 'After all you and our wife wouldn't hurt Jews and therefore they would not harm you.' 'I'm scared', said Mohammed, and rushed his horse to get going."

We felt very bad. "I'll take care of your house", said father. "The land will be quiet"...

Time passed, and during that time my parents' hope, that their relative from Poland survived and will arrive in Israel, was lost. We did not see our landlord Mohammed, or his family, either.


d) Support for peaceful conflict resolution

Hebrew grammar, language and literature textbooks, especially those meant for elementary school, display mostly abstract messages of peace, and do not exactly
specify with what group or nation. However, the mere inclusion of poems that profess a hope for peace of course relay a message, clear to any Israeli reader, that the peace one wishes for is with the Arab nations, among them the Palestinians. Such poems are very common in literature textbooks and anthologies.

Quotes:

[...] There is one solution for preserving human life: not steel plates, not tanks, not airplanes, not cement fortresses, the solution is one – peace. We will continue on the road to peace vehemently and passionately. We will not let go, not give up, peace will vanquish all our enemies, because the other option is bad for all of us.

"Peace" is a blessing.

"Peace" is a prayer.

"Peace" is a word you will hear
At any time, every day every hour.

"Peace" is what you say when you meet
Children and adults:

Peace to you and how are you,
We were delighted to see you!

"Peace" is said when you depart,
From friends or girlfriends,
And if you wish, you also add:

Goodbye!

But peace, real "peace"
Is a wish, is a dream.

Peace that we all want,
Always peace, not battle, not fire
Therefore we all aspire:

Let there be peace upon Israel!

If I will come upon the mine of peace –

I will go into it and I will quarry the precious delicacy of "peace",

I would spread it among men – and peace will survive everywhere.

Then people of enemy nations and races will meet,

Those who first met in the battle field and war,

They will hug each other […]

Then they will go to the holy river, the river of peace

And there they will shatter their weapons […]

And beat their swords into plowshares,

Too fulfill the holy words of Isaiah.

Please come, come to the tree of peace,

We will shake each other's hand held out in peace,

So that we will live a life of happiness and those who will come –

Please come, come together, come!

5. Jewish and Bible Studies Books

a) A balanced description of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and encouraging the student to develop independent thought

Israeli Bible and Judaism textbooks do not contain much material pertaining to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict or peace process, but they do, on occasion, encourage the students to find the affinity between events mentioned in the Bible, including holy places and settlements in and around the state of Israel, and current day events and places.

Quotes:

Who, in your opinion, acts in a more positive manner in this chapter [Genesis 33], Jacob or Esau? Explain your opinion.

Do you think that in our day this type of reconciliation between two hostile nations is also possible?

Base your answers on examples from ancient and modern history.


Hebron was a very ancient city. Its name was already mentioned in ancient Egyptian writings.

The Fathers: Abraham, Isaac and Jacob, dwelt there when they roamed the land.
Abraham bought the Cave of Patriarchs there.

In the cave of Patriarchs Abraham and Sarah, Isaac and Rebecca, Jacob and Leah were buried.

In Hebron king David ruled over Judea, and it was his capital city.

(In: Learning from Exodus to Deuteronomy: Obligatory Chapters and Activities for the Books of Exodus, Leviticus, Numbers, Deuteronomy, 2008, p. 138.)

The Jews came back to the city [of Hebron] and built Jewish neighborhoods there, restored the ruined synagogue and reconstructed the ancient cemetery. In 193 the "Oslo Accords" were signed, and later on the "Hebron Agreement" that gave the Palestinian authority most of the territory of Hebron and left the area where the Jews lied under Israeli control. Adjacent to Hebron a Jewish city was built – Kiryat Arba.

(History, Bible and What Happened, Book of Samuel II, 2007, p. 39)

b) Acknowledgment of the Palestinian "other"

Despite the fact that the mere connection between a place or an event that are mentioned in the bible to a place or event around which there is Israeli-Palestinian tension could seem like a message supporting Israeli presence in a specific area, Bible textbooks also show the Muslim and Christian affinity to Israel and its holy places. One should add that quotes on Palestinian matters are relatively rare, since most of the text deals with biblical times and does not refer very often to current events.
The name "Palestine" for the Land of Israel is named after the Philistines who dwelt there. After the Bar Kokhva revolt (138 AD), when the Romans conquered the Land of Israel, they called it Palestine, after the Philistines [...]. When the British received the Mandate over the Land of Israel from the League of Nations, after World War I (1918), they called it Palestine [...]. Since the establishment of the state of Israel the Arabs of Israel and Arab refugees are called "Palestinians" [...].


The Cave of Patriarchs is sacred for Jews and Muslims. During the days of the Second Temple of Jerusalem a large building was raised on the cave for prayer. In the 6th century the Christians added a church to it. The church was demolished after the Muslim occupation, and instead a mosque was erected. During the crusades the mosque was destroyed [...]. According to Muslim tradition Ishmael and Esau are also buried in the Cave of Patriarchs. [...]


c) Awareness of positions, points of view and suffering of the Palestinian "other"

Among the textbooks included in the study, it was found that Bible and Judaism studies textbooks do not mention the subjects of Palestinian suffering or Palestinian
narrative or point of view regarding the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, but this is mostly because there is little reference to anything outside the biblical scope (or that of other Jewish religious writings). References to modern subjects are few and usually pertain to other subjects (such as agriculture or slavery), and when the subject is war or peace, there are mostly messages aiming quite generally towards peace (and usually not to the Palestinian issue specifically), as can be seen in the following sub-chapter.

\[d\text{)} Support for peaceful conflict resolution\]

Bible and Judaism books portray peace as the historic wish of every Jew – and even show how this aspiration is presented in the biblical text, which in turn gives religious legitimacy to that aspiration. Although here and there we see specific references to peace with the Palestinians, the message of generally advocating peace is much more common.

\textit{Quotes:}

\textit{Do You think peace between all the people in the world is possible? Explain.}

\textit{[...] Much like animals, what qualities will people have to change in order to live in a world of peace and serenity?}

a. "Nation will not take up sword against nation, nor will they train for war anymore" (2:1-4).

This prophecy of Isaiah [...] is one of the most well known in the Western world as it expresses a universal aspiration for peace that everyone desires.


[Caption reads: "And they beat their swords into 'pens'" (the word "pens" resembles the word for "plowshares" in Hebrew), Shmulik Katz, Maariv, 14.9.93].


The murder of Gedaliah – a historic mourning

[...] Yitzhak Rabin, who one the Noble prize, signed an agreement with the Palestinians – the "Oslo Agreement". As part of this agreement the state of Israel
recognized the right of the Palestinian people to an independent state. The Oslo agreement reflected the wish to end the violent conflict between us and the Palestinians and turn over a new leaf of peace between the two people.

6. Arabic Language Books (for the Jewish sector)

a) A balanced description of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and encouraging the student to develop independent thought

The Arabic textbooks that are intended for teaching Arabic to the Israeli Jewish sector, and are approved by the Israeli Ministry of Education, include quotes that pertain to both sides of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, while attempting to maintain objectivity and factual reporting. They contain descriptions that pertain to peace negotiations with Arab states and the Palestinians, but also to Palestinian terrorist acts or actions of the Israeli government that are shown as damaging to the Palestinians.

Additionally, these books often feature lengthy and respectful quotes from the Koran or regarding Islam, its history and religious precepts. (The following all appear in the books in Arabic).

Quotes:

The Israeli news agency reports that the Foreign Affairs and Defense Committee is discussing the peace process between Israel and its Arab neighbors.


Quotes from the Arab Press:

[...]  
5 – A man was arrested under suspicion for detonating a bomb near a car driven by two Israeli officers north of Al Quds.
6 – Two bombs exploded in Kfar Saba and a third in Ashkelon

7 – Two military actions against Israeli targets in Lebanon

[...]

11 – Two new settlements in the [Gaza] Strip

[...]

19 – Two Israeli soldiers were injured when an explosive device was set off in Nabatia

20 – Israeli authorities will close two entrances to the old city in Nablus

[...]

22 - Two Molotov cocktails were tossed on two army cars in Khan Yunis

[...]

25 – Two hand grenades on two army cars in the Gaza Strip


Friday is a holy day in Islam, and it was said about it that: "Friday is a great and significant day. It is the best of days about which the Prophet said: the best day in which the sun rose is the sixth day- on it the first man was created, on it he went into the Garden of Eden and on it he was removed from it. There is no better time to pray than on the sixth day". In the center of this day there is the mandatory public prayer on Friday afternoon and before it a sermon is said. According to this passage and the one after it the Muslim can continue his business before the Jamaa [Friday Prayer] or after it, but he must be present at the prayer itself.

(In: Koran Verses in the Eye of the Commentator, 2000, p. 44).
1. The Jews, the Christians and the Muslims believe in a God that created the heavens and the earth.

2. Do you know the date in which the Prophet emigrated from Mecca to Medina? The Prophet emigrated in the year 622 AD, which is the first year according to the Muslim calendar.

3. The Arab pagan tribes fought the messenger of Allah, who called them to worship Allah alone.

4. The prophet Mohammed was raised by his grandfather, because he was born after his father died.

5. Next lesson, we will learn about the five precepts of Islam.

6. The teacher told his students: write in your notebooks what you know about the beginning of Islam!

7. […]

8. The Prophet grew up in the city of "Mecca" and immigrated from it to "Medina" until he returned to it and conquered it.

9. What did you learn in history class about the life of the Prophet?

10. We read about [pagan] gods, that the Arabs worshiped and believed in.

11. […]

12. […]

13. The elders of the Kureish fought the prophet and did not believe in him and in God.

14. […]

15. Hadija is the name of a rich merchant, who the Prophet took (as a wife).

16. This man is a Muslim (who) believes in God and his messenger.

17. Write your homework about an Islamic subject!

b) Acknowledgment of the Palestinian "other"

Arabic books define Palestinians as such, especially when referring to Palestinians who are not Israeli citizens. However, there is no focus on the subject of Palestinian nationality or an explanation of it. Israeli Palestinians are mentioned either by their first and/or last name, or as residents of a city or village, and are not described as "Palestinians" (although since some Arab textbooks are quite old, it is possible that this self-definition was not as popular or as acceptable as it is today).

Quotes:

Arafat will receive a congratulatory telegram from King Hussein

Gaza [...] President Arafat – the chairman of the Palestine Liberation Organization, the Chairman of the Palestinian National Authority – received a telegram yesterday from his majesty King Hussein, king of the Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan for the blessed month of Ramadan.

[The king] wished in his telegram that we may live to have the opportunity again and that the wishes and the goals of our Arab and Muslim nation will come true with pride, honor and success.


Jerusalem is sacred to the three major religions.

Segments from the Arab Press:

[...]

9 – Arafat will discuss in Algeria the subject of Palestinian reconciliation.


c) Awareness of positions, points of view and suffering of the Palestinian "other"

Arabic Books do not discuss the subject of Palestinian suffering following the war of 1948 or following other Israeli military actions, although this is part of these books' tendency not to state an opinion regarding the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, but rather only quote articles or write factual sentences, which do not contain any opinion.

However, the Palestinian point of view, especially that of the Israeli Palestinians (citizens of Israel), is often presented and many of the dialogues contain descriptions from everyday life and therefore contribute to the readers' identification and empathy towards them. This, in turn, of course promotes tolerance and true reconciliation – when students see them as "a person first".

Quotes:

_By the Sea_

_I live in Haifa on Mount Carmel. Haifa is a beautiful and clean city in the north of Israel between the sea and Mount Carmel. Its houses are new and old and Jews and Arabs live in them._

_[...] One Friday morning a week ago, my friend Jamal from Acre visited me, we went to the beach, we swam and we played together. At noon we put on our clothes and_
went to a restaurant by the beach. We ate and drank, and then Jamal took the bus to Acre and I went back to my home.


From the Arabic press:

[...]  

11 – The fighting around the refugee camps in Beirut was renewed.


Inspired by this chapter of the Koran [regarding Joseph] the Palestinian poet Mahmoud Darwish wrote a poem named: "O my father, I am Joseph". The following is the poem and its translation:

O my father, I am Joseph. O father, my brothers neither love me nor want me in their midst.
O my Father, they assault me and cast stones and words at me. They want me to die so they can eulogize me. They closed the door of your house and left me outside. [...] O my father. They destroyed my toys.
When the passing gentle wind played with My hair they were jealous, they flamed up with rage against me and you. What did I do to them, O my father? The butterflies landed on my shoulder, and the grain bent down to me and the birds hovered over me, and what have I done, O my father? And why me?
You named me Joseph and they threw me into the well of love and blamed the wolf, though the wolf is more merciful than my brothers, O my father!

Did I wrong anyone when I said

I saw the sun and the moon and eleven star, bowing down before me?


d) Support for peaceful conflict resolution

Arabic textbooks contain references to peace talks and the peace process, although they usually refrain from expressing any support for one side or the other. If support is given, it is for peace and portrays it as the ideal final goal.

Quotes:

Exercise 11: Fill in the blanks with the appropriate verb:

7 – The [Answer: longed for] _______ will arrive soon God willing.


We hold out our hand in peace to our neighbors.
The Prime Minister will approve Israel’s wish for peace in his speech.

(Ibid, p. 80).

Palestinian-Russian talks in Tunisia

Tunisia – Exclusive – It is anticipated that the Palestinian leadership will meet next week with the director of the Middle East division in the Russian Foreign Ministry as an emissary for his government, in order to have consultations that have to do with the peace process and have a second round of a multilateral conference in Rome as part of the Russian-Palestinian coordination policy on which was agreed earlier.

Additionally, the talks will also have to do with the Palestinian offers that will be submitted to the committees in which the Palestinian with take part and especially the refugee and water committees.

("Al Nahar" Newspaper – Al Quds)

**Discussion**

Findings show that Israeli school textbooks contain many messages that encourage and promote peace and tolerance, and that, as a whole, they uphold the standards set by UNESCO for peace and tolerance education and translated to the four following criteria:

1. A balanced description of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and encouraging the student to develop independent thought;
2. Acknowledgment of the Palestinian "other";
3. Awareness of positions, points of view and suffering of the Palestinian "other";
4. Support for peaceful conflict resolution.

Findings were divided according to different disciplines and demonstrate that although every discipline is characterized by specific traits, the four criteria are relevant in almost all of them, despite having different and unique textual and graphic expressions. If one criteria or another is less relevant, it is because the subject of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict is raised less in textbooks of that specific discipline (i.e. Bible studies), and not because the books contain any inciting contents, stereotypes or such contents that encourage violence against the Palestinian side.

**History textbooks**

Findings show that Israeli history textbooks attempt to portray a precise and balanced picture, without prejudice, of the Israeli-Palestinian peace process, and also present the points of view of Palestinians, their narrative, their rationale and their personal and national experiences, alongside Israeli ones. However, one should note that often the Palestinian side is depicted as the aggressor while the Israeli side is portrayed as defending itself from the attack – although the Palestinian rationale for the attack is
usually given – whether as a response to what is seen as a Jewish or Israeli threat, or as revenge or protest against a Jewish or Israeli activity.

In general, the emergence of Palestinian nationalism is described as beginning in the beginning of the 20th century, and Palestinians are depicted as the majority residence in the Land of Israel before the first Jewish immigration waves (beginning in the late 19th century). Additionally, books factually present the different conflicts and peace agreements (including the Oslo Accords) and provide a variety of opinions by Jewish and occasionally Arab or Palestinian personas, from both left and right. Textbooks then ask the students what they think about difficult and complex issues regarding the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, thus aiding students in forming an independent opinion.

**Geography textbooks**

Israeli geography textbooks feature several maps which include the territories of the Palestinian Authority according to the Oslo Accords (either partially or fully), or which illustrate the Green Line – particularly when referencing the Palestinians or the borders of the state of Israel. In some of the maps that do not address the Israeli-Palestinian relationship or the borders of Israel there is no border line but Palestinian settlements are mentioned either graphically or by name alongside Jewish ones.

Additionally, much like history textbooks, geography school textbooks address the Israeli-Palestinian issue factually and objectively, acknowledging Palestinian suffering caused by the conflict and discussing the lives of Palestinian Israeli citizens in the past and in the present. These books also present the facts to the students and invite them to judge the situation for themselves and form an independent opinion on the matter at hand. Geography textbooks also describe peace negotiations and peace agreements, including specific issues such as water or inter-state tourism and commerce, and portray the Israeli-Palestinian situation as an ongoing peace process, depicting peace as an optimal, close and possible solution for all sides.
Civics textbooks

Civics textbooks present the Palestinian subject factually and without prejudice, both regarding the national identity of Palestinian Israeli citizens, and regarding to the different opinions in Israeli and Palestinian society pertaining to conflict resolution, including the option of relinquishing territories as part of an Israeli-Palestinian peace agreement. Textbooks emphasize the right of equality for Palestinian Israeli citizens, include their narrative regarding their Palestinian identity and their sympathy for their Palestinian brethren outside Israel, and critically examine the actions and attitudes displayed by (predominantly) Jewish-Israeli government and society towards the Palestinian-Israeli population.

Hebrew language and literature textbooks

Literature anthologies, grammar and Hebrew language books include segments that pertain to peace agreements, Yitzhak Rabin and his legacy and Ben Gurion and his legacy. In these books one can find two very different sides: one the one hand, we find descriptions that present Palestinian (and Arab) aggression against the Jews as harsh and unjustified, and on the other hand, other passages and works communicate a clear message against war and openly pro-peace and coexistence with Arabs and specifically with Palestinians.

Bible and Judaism textbooks

Textbooks that give interpretations for the Bible and later Jewish religious writings often relay what they see as current events that have an affinity to the subjects raised in these writings, among others – to the Israeli-Arab and Israeli-Palestinian conflict. These books often present Jewish and Biblical sources that promote a message of peace and oppose violent conflict resolution. However, they contain only a limited amount of texts that address current day events, and even less that have to do with the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, and therefore the study did not find any references to Palestinian point of view and suffering.
**Arabic textbooks**

Textbooks designed to teach Arabic for the Jewish sector contain many stories and dialogues including Palestinian Israeli citizens (and in fact include all Arabic-speaking Israeli citizens: Palestinians, Bedouin, Druze and Jewish Arab speakers), and present them and their everyday lives to the students. These books teach pupils, among other things, about Islamic precepts, the history of Islam and key verses from the Koran – all in a respectful manner that represents the Muslim point of view. Peace agreements and events pertaining to Palestinians who are not Israeli citizens are described shortly and factually, and books avoid expressing any political point of view, aside from a general support for peace in the Middle East.
Summary

This report represents the results of IMPACT-SE's study of 149 Israeli textbooks for the state and state-religious sectors for 2009-2012. The study has examined the attitudes of school textbooks to the Palestinian "other", to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and to the peace process and peace agreements between Israel and the Palestinians.

Findings show that, as a whole, Israeli textbooks uphold the UNESCO guidelines and recommendations for peace and tolerance as they: (1) Attempt to give a balanced description of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and encourage the students to form their own independent opinion given the different facts and attitudes presented to them; (2) Promote recognition of the Palestinian "other" and the legitimacy of the Palestinian national identity; (3) Provide the student with information that raises their awareness towards the positions, points of view and suffering of the Palestinian "other"; and (4) Overwhelmingly, often and clearly communicate messages that support a peaceful resolution for the Israeli-Palestinian conflict.

To elaborate, the study findings show that Israeli school textbooks clearly attempt:

(a) To avoid demonizing, stereotyping or demeaning the Palestinian "other";

(b) To show that the ideal, just and practical solution of the conflict is peace;

(c) To glorify the values of democracy, human rights and tolerance, and to portray violence as a last resort and as a course of action with devastating effects to all involved;

(d) To encourage pupils to learn more about Palestinian and Arab culture and history, and about the Palestinian affinity to the Land of Israel and to its Muslim and Christian holy places;

(e) To relay Palestinian opinions, points of view and narratives (especially of Palestinians who are Israeli citizens);
(f) To portray the Palestinians as a people with a national historic identity and the national Palestinian movement as a legitimate national movement.

It is, however, important to note that Israeli school textbooks feature mostly events that pertain to the state of Israel and to the Jewish people (although there are entire books that only focus on other people and cultures, which also elaborate on Arab and Muslim countries and societies). Additionally, Palestinian narratives and Palestinian points of view in Israeli textbooks usually belong to Palestinian Israeli citizens and only a small part reference non-Israeli Palestinians (Palestinian Authority residents or others). Furthermore, the Arab side (and particularly the Palestinian side) is usually presented as the initiator of violence within the Arab-Israeli conflict, and textbooks occasionally feature Palestinian violence as such that justifies a violent response by the self-defending Jewish/Israeli side (especially in the 1948 war).

However, it is important to note that quite often textbooks also present the rational and the reasoning behind these (Palestinian) attacks – such as an attempt to prevent the Palestinian population from being threatened or hurt, or as a civilian form of political protest against a Jewish or Israeli perceived transgression against Palestinians - their bodies, their possessions, their religious beliefs or their status.
Further Reading

If you wish to learn more about IMPACT SE’s Israeli textbooks project, read past reports and see all the original excerpts from the Israeli textbooks, as well as read other reports about textbooks in the Middle East, go to www.impact-se.org.

Book List

The following list includes the 149 books used in the study (in Hebrew), whether their excerpts appear in this report or not. A full database of all the excerpts according to book title and subject can be found at www.impact-se.org.

1. אבני שפה, שלב א’: תבנית, תבנית, תבנית במקסימום, אילת ברגר, מודן, 2010.
5. אוריינות ספרותית לתלמיד, דרוה שטראל, מודן, 2010.
11. אל מ devel: מתכני אמונות ומגמות בעידן האמנציפציה (ע”ם יעל), כל המגמות, כרוניקל, תל אביב, 2005.
ישר אל במאה ה-01, ספר הכנה לבגרות, איריס גריאר, אבי פין, מairoה שגב, ונירית נחוס-לי, מטח, נושאים גיאוגרפיים לחטיבה העליונה, מטח, 2009.